Legal Considerations for Municipal Decarbonization

Amy E. Turner
Senior Fellow, Sabin Center for Climate Change Law
Associate Research Scholar, Columbia Law School

National League of Cities Congressional Cities Conference
Energy, Environment and Natural Resources Committee

March 8, 2020
Cities Climate Law Initiative

A new project of the Sabin Center aimed at helping U.S. cities achieve their climate mitigation commitments (e.g., 80x50, net zero GHGs or 100% renewable energy) by addressing legal questions or obstacles to carbon mitigation laws and policies.

Cities are at the forefront of climate policy and action. The Cities Climate Law Initiative is available to help U.S. cities advance legal and policy tools that will drive down local greenhouse gas emissions.
Municipal Climate Commitments

• Many city, town & county commitments to 80x50, net zero, etc.
• 160+ cities and at least 13 counties committed to 100% renewable energy (Sierra Club)
• Groups like Climate Mayors, C40 Cities and work by the National League of Cities
Municipal GHG Mitigation Legal & Policy Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BUILDINGS: benchmarking, energy efficiency, mandatory retrofits, building codes, green roofs, green/energy-aligned leasing...</th>
<th>TRANSPORTATION: public transit, bike &amp; pedestrian infrastructure, micromobility, low emissions zones, congestion pricing, freight emissions, electric vehicles...</th>
<th>ENERGY: utility-scale renewables, distributed generation, community solar, carbon trading, RECs and VPPAs..</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WASTE: recycling and organics, construction waste management, bans on single-use plastic...</td>
<td>EQUITY &amp; ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE: Green New Deal policies, encouraging broad participation in climate policy-setting...</td>
<td>...and much more.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

• U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

• U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions

• State law preemption and enabling statutes
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

• U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions
• State law preemption and enabling statutes
• Legal authority and challenges vary from city to city
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

- U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions
- State law preemption and enabling statutes
- Legal authority and challenges vary from city to city
- Rapidly developing areas of entrepreneurship and the law
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

• U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions
• State law preemption and enabling statutes
• Legal authority and challenges vary from city to city
• Rapidly developing areas of entrepreneurship and the law
• **Contracting with or between private parties**
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

• U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions
• State law preemption and enabling statutes
• Legal authority and challenges vary from city to city
• Rapidly developing areas of entrepreneurship and the law
• Contracting with or between private parties
• Privacy laws
Legal Obstacles to City GHG Emission Policies

• U.S. federal law – preemption, constitutional restrictions
• State law preemption and enabling statutes
• Legal authority and challenges vary from city to city
• Rapidly developing areas of entrepreneurship and the law
• Contracting with or between private parties
• Privacy laws

See blog post in your packet and on Sabin Center website
Policy Case Studies

These legal considerations are not meant to kill policy proposals, but municipalities may need to think analytically and creatively to achieve policy goals.
Natural Gas Bans/All-Electric Construction
Natural Gas Bans/All-Electric Construction

- Can’t copy & paste policies from one jurisdiction to another
  - *i.e.*, the California and Massachusetts approaches
Natural Gas Bans/All-Electric Construction

• Can’t copy & paste policies from one jurisdiction to another
  • *I.e., the California and Massachusetts approaches*

• **Potential for federal preemption**
  • *Energy Policy & Conservation Act (EPCA)*
Natural Gas Bans/All-Electric Construction

• Can’t copy & paste policies from one jurisdiction to another
  • *i.e.*, the California and Massachusetts approaches

• Potential for federal preemption
  • *Energy Policy & Conservation Act* (EPCA)

• **Navigating the boundaries of state and local law**
  • *Unclear yet whether Massachusetts state law preempts Brookline’s by-law*
  • *California local energy codes need California Energy Commission approval*
  • *Arizona’s preemption of local natural gas bans*
Natural Gas Bans/All-Electric Construction

• Can’t copy & paste policies from one jurisdiction to another
  • *I.e., the California and Massachusetts approaches*

• Potential for federal preemption
  • *Energy Policy & Conservation Act (EPCA)*

• Navigating the boundaries of state and local law
  • *Unclear yet whether Massachusetts state law preempts Brookline’s by-law*
  • *California local energy codes need California Energy Commission approval*
  • *Arizona’s preemption of local natural gas bans*

*See blog post in your packet and on Sabin Center website*
Low Traffic Zones (Congestion Pricing & LEZs)
Low Traffic Zones (Congestion Pricing & LEZs)

• Potential for federal preemption (and federal agency interplay)
Low Traffic Zones (Congestion Pricing & LEZs)

- Potential for federal preemption (and federal agency interplay)

- Navigating the boundaries of state and local law
  - Tolling authority, state vehicle or highway laws
Low Traffic Zones (Congestion Pricing & LEZs)

• Potential for federal preemption (and federal agency interplay)
• Navigating the boundaries of state and local law
  • Tolling authority, state vehicle or highway laws
• Privacy laws
  • E.g., Neal v. Fairfax Cty Police Dep’t (2018) –“pictures & data associated with each license plate # constitute ‘personal information’” under VA state law
  • E.g., California Consumer Privacy Act (2020) –protections for handling data
Low Traffic Zones (Congestion Pricing & LEZs)

• **Potential for federal preemption (and federal agency interplay)**

• **Navigating the boundaries of state and local law**
  • *Tolling authority, state vehicle or highway laws*

• **Privacy laws**
  • *E.g., Neal v. Fairfax Cty Police Dep’t (2018) – “pictures & data associated with each license plate # constitute ‘personal information’” under VA state law*
  • *E.g., California Consumer Privacy Act (2020) – protections for handling data*

  See blog post and paper on Sabin Center website
Cities Climate Law Initiative

Amy E. Turner
Senior Fellow, Sabin Center for Climate Change Law
Associate Research Scholar, Columbia Law School

aturner@law.columbia.edu
climate.law.columbia.edu, for our work and for a link to the Climate Law Blog

In particular: We partner directly with U.S. cities, towns, counties and other municipal governments on legal questions, issues and projects to help advance municipal greenhouse gas mitigation policies.

Please be in touch!